

## The Presbytery of Santa Barbara

### Guidelines for a Process for Reconciliation or Gracious Separation of a Congregation from the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.)

DRAFT - amended by writing group March 2013 and by Presbytery Council 4-17-13 for the May 4, 2013 presbytery meeting

#### INTRODUCTION

The 218th General Assembly (2008) of the Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.), hereinafter PC(USA), approved Commissioners' Resolution Item 04-28 which urged (adapted for the 2011-2013 Book of Order): "that presbyteries and synods develop and make available to lower governing bodies and local congregations a process that exercises the responsibility and power 'to divide, dismiss, or dissolve churches in consultation with their members' (Book of Order, **G-3.0301a**) with consistency, pastoral responsibility, accountability, gracious witness, openness, and transparency. Believing that trying to exercise this responsibility and power through litigation is deadly to the cause of Christ, impacting the local church, other parts of the Body of Christ and ecumenical relationships, and our witness to Christ in the world around us, the General Assembly urges congregations considering leaving the denomination, presbyteries and synods to implement a process using the following principles:

- Consistency: The local authority delegated to presbyteries is guided and shaped by our shared faith, service, and witness to Jesus Christ.
- Pastoral Responsibility: The requirement in **G-3.0301.a** to consult with the members of a church seeking dismissal highlights the presbytery's pastoral responsibility, which must not be submerged beneath other responsibilities.
- Accountability: For a governing body, accountability rightly dictates fiduciary and connectional concerns, raising general issues of property (G-4.200) and specific issues of schism within a congregation (G-4.0207). But, full accountability also requires preeminent concern with 'caring for the flock.'
- Gracious Witness: ... Scripture and the Holy Spirit require a gracious witness from us rather than a harsh legalism.
- Openness and Transparency: Early, open communication and transparency about principles and process of dismissal necessarily serve truth, order, and goodness, and work against seeking civil litigation as a solution."

The rationale supporting this resolution stated that it is easy to "emphasize the property trust responsibilities of presbytery/synod oversight to the exclusion of the pastoral responsibility of caring for the congregations (members staying and leaving) and the responsibility of public witness to Christ with the larger body of Christ and the community and world." Secondly, it was suggested that presbyteries should be consistent in communicating how they will respond to congregations seeking dismissal and that all parties should engage in a more grace-filled exchange.

## The VISION OF THE PRESBYTERY OF SANTA BARBARA

46  
47  
48  
49  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60  
61  
62  
63  
64  
65  
66  
67  
68  
69  
70  
71  
72  
73  
74  
75  
76  
77  
78  
79  
80  
81  
82  
83  
84  
85  
86  
87  
88  
89  
90  
91

The vision of the Presbytery of Santa Barbara is to grow congregations that passionately engage their community to make disciples. Our mission is to -

- Confess Jesus Christ as Lord
- Connect one another in ministry
- Challenge one another for mission.

The Presbytery of Santa Barbara seeks to facilitate worship, mission, and other shared ministries by engaging all of the churches in our bounds to be united in carrying out our vision and mission. Naturally, the presbytery wants to retain all of its member congregations within the PC(USA). However, in some cases, the desire to withdraw entirely from the PC(USA) may be so deeply felt and widely held that the best thing is to honor the will of the congregation while fairly protecting the interests of all parties involved.

The Presbytery of Santa Barbara is committed to pursuing reconciliation with pastors, sessions, and congregations who are considering dismissal from the denomination. Whether that reconciliation takes the form of dismissal, mutually accepted re-commitment to the presbytery-congregational relationship, or something in-between, it is the will of this presbytery to create a gracious context and process in which the will of God is sought for the life, ministry, and calling of the particular congregation. All congregations of this presbytery are invited to commit to this broad understanding of reconciliation with a graciousness befitting those who claim Jesus as Lord.

The presbytery and congregations will be continually guided by these principles:

The Mission of God as expressed in the Great Ends of the Church is greater than the PC(USA)

We affirm that should presbytery dismiss a congregation to another Reformed body, the unity of the one Church of Jesus Christ has not been diminished. (F-1.0302 and F-1.0304)

The exercise of “mutual forbearance” is of utmost importance in our process. Therefore, all will treat each other with respect regardless of theological and ecclesiological differences. We will pray and work for fairness to all parties in our decisions.

In matters of controversy, a larger part of the Church (or a representation of it) should govern a smaller. Our system of councils in regular gradation reflects this understanding (F-3.0203).

In accordance with G-4.0207, the presbytery has the right and responsibility to assess the situation in cases of conflict in a congregation. Accordingly, the presbytery needs to inquire and make an informed judgment as to: the possibilities of reconciliation; what or who is preventing reconciliation; approximately how many people are determined to leave and how many wish to remain in the PC(USA); does the congregation understand what it is being asked to consider and have the implications of leaving the PC(USA) been fully and fairly explained; and has the process been open and fair to all concerned? This assessment shall be made via open forums and discussion. It is important that the process of discernment be conducted in a way that seeks the

92 truth and is fair to all parties. Requests made by the congregation will not be considered valid  
93 unless the presbytery has first met with and received the cooperation of the session and any  
94 installed teaching elders and determined that the principles and procedures herein outlined will  
95 be fairly implemented.

96  
97 The example of the apostles and of the early Church is authoritative in dealing with such matters.  
98 The Council at Jerusalem engaged in a process of discernment as it exercised leadership and  
99 oversight over the missionary activities of Paul and Barnabas. The role of testimony, prayer,  
100 discussion, deliberation, and collective discernment of the will of God were, and are, important.  
101 The process by which a congregation comes to decide that it is being called by God to seek  
102 dismissal and realignment shall respect dissent and should safeguard and provide sufficient time  
103 and opportunities so that the will of God can be received by the whole congregation. A rush to  
104 judgment is not consistent with Biblical principles or Reformed polity.

### 105 106 THE PROCESS

107  
108 The following process incorporates these principles with the clear understanding that, in  
109 particular cases, circumstances may require modification and flexibility in the interest of fairness  
110 and practical wisdom.

111  
112 In the Presbyterian tradition, an inter-connected relationship is assumed between the presbytery  
113 and its congregations. Therefore, no congregation will be dismissed to another Reformed body  
114 unless and until, at a minimum, the following process is followed. A congregation can be  
115 dismissed with property to another Reformed body recognized by the PC(USA) and/or the  
116 Presbytery of Santa Barbara. It cannot be dismissed to “independency.”

117  
118 As noted under “Other Book Provisions below, failure to follow this process may result in the  
119 appointment of an Administrative Commission and assumption of original jurisdiction in  
120 accordance with G-3.0109b.

#### 121 122 The Session and the Presbytery Response Team

123  
124 The Session and its pastor/moderator, after consideration, prayer and a minimum two-thirds  
125 majority vote of the Session, notifies the presbytery so it may form a Presbytery Response Team  
126 (PRT) in order to engage the congregation in discussions about potential resolution or dismissal  
127 for identified reasons of conscience. Once action has been initiated to form a PRT, the Session  
128 shall provide the PRT with the membership roll. All deletions and additions of active members  
129 of the congregation shall be open to review by the PRT to determine the appropriateness of these  
130 changes.

131  
132 The PRT will consist of a Chairperson appointed by the Presbytery Council in consultation with  
133 the Committee on Ministry skilled in conflict resolution; and at least two others chosen by the  
134 Council, including at least one ruling elder and one teaching elder. ***It is the intention of  
135 Presbytery Council to develop a pool of members who have been trained so that they may be  
136 called upon to respond quickly to a congregation that has expressed concerns that might lead  
137 to a request for dismissal. As a part of the PRT training, the PRT will receive resources and***

138 **materials pertaining but not limited to an exploration of the covenant relationship between the**  
139 **congregation and the denomination.** When the PRT meets with the Session, such meetings will  
140 be moderated by the PRT Chairperson. On occasion, the PRT Chairperson may ask the  
141 pastor(s)/session moderator to excuse him or herself from a particular meeting.

142  
143 The PRT will not determine the merits of the concerns raised by the Session, but will work to  
144 assure the issues have been addressed fairly and accurately. The PRT will promptly report the  
145 results of the initial meeting with the Session and its recommendations to the Presbytery Council.  
146 The PRT may then work with the Session to convene a congregational gathering for the purpose  
147 of hearing from the members and discerning how many members desire that the congregation be  
148 dismissed to another Reformed body with which the presbytery deems itself to be in fellowship.

#### 149 150 The Initial Meeting of the Congregation

151  
152 The PRT expects that at least fifty percent of the active membership will participate in this initial  
153 gathering meeting which will be moderated by a teaching or ruling elder appointed for this  
154 purpose by the Presbytery Council. The members of the PRT will attend this gathering and will  
155 be allowed sufficient time to speak on behalf of the PC(USA). During this gathering the PRT  
156 will ensure that the members of the congregation have been informed regarding the polity and  
157 practice of the Reformed body to which they may be going, including any practical implications  
158 this might mean for the congregation.

159  
160 If the PRT determines that a significant proportion (estimated at more than 2/3) of the attending  
161 members wish to be dismissed, a second gathering will be convened. After the initial  
162 congregational gathering, at least three months will pass before this second gathering. This  
163 allows the PRT to carry out the following functions:

- 164  
165 1. Negotiate the terms of separation with the Session in accordance with the requirements  
166 of the presbytery **that reflect current and/or future fiscal and ecclesiastical PC(USA)**  
167 **directives.** These agreed upon terms will be voted on at the second congregational  
168 gathering as an integral part of any request for dismissal.
- 169  
170 2. Meet with the members of the congregation who wish to remain within the PC(USA) to  
171 best strategize how to either maintain an existing mission presence, incorporate members  
172 into nearby Presbyterian congregations, or create a new entity.
- 173  
174 3. Meet with Teaching Elders currently called or employed by the congregation to  
175 determine whether they shall remain with the congregation and transfer their ministerial  
176 status to the new denomination, whether they shall remain within the PC(USA) and need to  
177 request permission from the Committee on Ministry to serve in another Reformed body, or  
178 whether they shall remain in the PC(USA) and have been enrolled as a member at large of  
179 the presbytery. Teaching Elders shall be encouraged to review the Board of Pension  
180 policies. Reasonable steps shall be taken to provide support and care to those Teaching  
181 Elders wishing to stay in the PC(USA) and not desiring to serve in a congregation of the  
182 other Reformed body.

183

184 4. Meet with any members of the congregation who are preparing for ministry and are  
185 under the care of presbytery. Each member under care together with his/her liaison from  
186 the Committee on Preparation for Ministry shall be advised immediately of the  
187 congregation's possible dismissal. The member under care will be given the option of  
188 being dismissed with the congregation or transferring their membership to another  
189 congregation within the PC(USA). If transfer to another congregation within the PC(USA)  
190 is requested, presbytery and the CPM liaison will assist the member in seeking a waiver of  
191 the usual six-month requirement for church membership in order to maintain care status.

192

### 193 The Second Gathering of the Congregation

194

195 After the PRT has completed these functions, a second gathering will be convened. Written  
196 notice shall be given by mail to all members at least 30 days prior to the time of the gathering, as  
197 well as announced from the pulpit of the church at regular church services on four successive  
198 Sundays immediately prior to the meeting. The gathering shall take place after 3:00 p.m. in the  
199 church sanctuary to give the members of the PRT and those traveling from other places sufficient  
200 time to attend. A concerted effort should be made to maximize the participation of the  
201 congregation in this gathering. There shall be at least 1/2 (50%) of the current active membership  
202 in attendance. An affirmative vote of at least 2/3 (two-thirds) of those in attendance is required in  
203 order to further the dismissal process. The Session must provide to the presbytery a list of  
204 members not wanting to leave the PC(USA) within 60 days of any vote by the presbytery to  
205 dismiss the congregation.

206

207 The PRT shall conduct the gathering, which is technically a meeting of the PRT, not a  
208 congregational meeting (since the Book of Order does not include seeking dismissal as a purpose  
209 for which a congregational meeting may be called). The PRT members shall again be allowed  
210 sufficient time to speak on behalf of the PC(USA). This meeting will be moderated by a member  
211 of the Committee on Ministry, the executive presbyter, or the stated clerk of presbytery in order  
212 to allow the members of the PRT to fulfill their advocacy role.

213

214 The Session will outline in detail the terms of the proposed dismissal including the financial  
215 terms. A written copy of these terms shall be provided to all attendees at the meeting.

216

217 The privilege of the floor is limited to persons who are appointed by the presbytery, active  
218 members **in good standing** of the particular congregation and Teaching Elders currently called  
219 and or employed by the congregation. Others will not be heard or allowed to cast a ballot  
220 regarding the request for dismissal. After a full and fair discussion, in which each person with  
221 the privilege of the floor present who wishes to speak (for up to five minutes) has had an  
222 opportunity to do so, a secret ballot of the congregation members will be taken on the categorical  
223 question: "Shall the membership of the \_\_\_\_\_ Presbyterian Church (U.S.A.) request  
224 dismissal as a body by the Presbytery of Santa Barbara to \_\_\_\_\_, another Reformed  
225 body in accordance with the terms, including the financial terms as negotiated by the presbytery  
226 and Session?" This motion may not be separated.

227

228 The ballots shall be counted by two elders from the congregation and two representatives of the  
229 presbytery. Only ballots clearly legible shall be counted. In case of ambiguity, the ballot will be

230 counted as “No.” Abstentions count as “No” votes. The ballots shall be counted twice and the  
231 results shall be announced at the meeting, and the results shall be communicated in writing by  
232 the PRT to the stated clerk of the presbytery.

233

234 Within ten days of the second gathering of the PRT with the congregation, any person of the  
235 unsuccessful side may contest the regularity of the call for, or the conduct of, or the manner of  
236 the request made at the meeting by a written notice to the presbytery. The Presbytery Council  
237 shall review the questions at issue and, if the contest is sustained, it shall direct the calling of a  
238 new meeting of the PRT with the congregation. The congregation shall continue to be a member  
239 church of the PC(USA) until such time as the required meeting takes place and the presbytery  
240 votes on any request for dismissal. Once the manner of the request is determined to be fair and  
241 regular, the decision of the Presbytery Council shall stand **and, ordinarily, no further action**  
242 **should be taken to reconsider the matter for at least 24 months.**

243

244

#### THE MEETING OF THE PRESBYTERY

245

246 The presbytery shall act in response to the congregation’s action. Following notice of any  
247 request for dismissal, the Moderator will follow the normal procedures for calling a meeting of  
248 presbytery, provided that there is not already scheduled a stated meeting of presbytery within 45  
249 days of the congregational request for dismissal. It should be noted that renegotiation of the  
250 terms for dismissal through use of amendments from the floor of presbytery would invalidate  
251 months of work between the PRT and the congregation. Therefore, the proposal shall be  
252 presented as a whole, with the understanding that the final agreement has been reached by good  
253 faith negotiations between the PRT and the congregation.

254

255 The PRT shall report the results of its meeting with the congregation, and the presbytery shall  
256 determine whether the process for requesting dismissal was fair and represents the will of the  
257 congregation. If so, the congregation shall be dismissed to another Reformed denomination,  
258 subject to any agreements that may be reached regarding the fair treatment of those members  
259 who do not wish to leave the denomination. If the presbytery determines that the request for  
260 dismissal was invalid, the request for dismissal should be denied, and the congregation shall  
261 remain a member of the PC(USA), **and, ordinarily, no further action should be taken to**  
262 **reconsider the matter for at least 24 months.**

263

264

#### FINANCIAL GUIDELINES

265

266 The financial guidelines that are a part of this document are still being worked on in committee  
267 and will be provided for presbytery consideration when they become available.

268

269

#### OTHER PROVISIONS

270

271 If a congregation or its leadership preemptively files suit in a civil court against the presbytery,  
272 the Presbytery of Santa Barbara may answer the suit. The presbytery may seek to preserve its  
273 assets and assert its rights.

274

275 If the staff or session of a congregation has initiated specific, concrete action to withdraw from  
276 this presbytery or the PC(USA), without prior consultation with the presbytery and the initiation  
277 of the above-described process, the presbytery may initiate an administrative commission. Such  
278 actions could include, but are not limited to, calling a meeting of members of the congregation to  
279 discuss the church's withdrawal from the denomination or the session voting to move toward  
280 membership in another denomination. The presbytery, at its next stated or called meeting,  
281 whichever occurs first, may appoint an administrative commission to address the situation at that  
282 church and attempt to modify the church's activities to follow the processes described above.  
283 The administrative commission may be granted any authority permitted in the Book of Order.  
284